### References

- Parle JV, Franklyn JA, Cross KW, et al. Thyroxine prescription in the community: serum thyroid stimulating hormone level assays as an indicator of undertreatment or overtreatment. Br J Gen Pract 1993: 43: 107-109.
- Thomas SHL, Sturgess I, Wedderburn A, et al. Clinical versus biochemical assessment in thyroxine replacement therapy: a retrospective study. J R Coll Physicians Lond 1990; 24: 289-291.
- Swansea Vocational Training Scheme. Evaluation of long term thyroid replacement treatment. BMJ 1985; 291: 1476-1478.
- 1985; Z91: 14/0-14/0.
   Tunbridge WMG, Evered DC, Hall R, et al. The spectrum of thyroid disease in a community: the Whickham survey. Clin Endocrinol 1977; 7: 481-493.
- Toft AD, Irvine WJ, McIntosh D, et al. Temporary hypothyroidism after surgical treatment of thyrotoxicosis. Lancet 1976; 2: 817-818.
   Sawers JSA, Toft AD, Irvine WJ, et al. Transient
- Sawers JSA, Toft AD, Irvine WJ, et al. Transient hypothyroidism after iodine-131 treatment of thyrotoxicosis. J Clin Endocrinol Metab 1980; 50: 226-229.
- Amino N, Mori H, Iwatani Y, et al. High prevalence of transient post-partum thyrotoxicosis and hypothyroidism. N Engl J Med 1982; 14: 1017-1021.
- Volpe R, McAllister W, Johnston W, Huber N. Thyroid function in subacute thyroidism. J Clin Endocrinol Metab 1958; 18: 65-78.
- Rizzolo PJ, Fischer PM. Re-evaluation of thyroid hormone status after long-term hormone therapy. J Fam Pract 1982; 14: 1017-1021.

# Formative and summative assessment

Sir,

We would like to comment on the editorial by Tombleson (May Journal, p.183). He points out that formative assessment is attractive to teachers because it measures improvement. Although true, there is a theoretical danger that trainees who are good at the commencement of training may be penalized because they show less improvement than colleagues who are poorer initially but then attain a similar standard of achievement. Furthermore, the trainer's eagerness to show improvement in a trainee's performance may bias his or her judgement.

The problem of assessor bias is a potential disadvantage of 'in house' assessment by trainers since poor trainee progress can pose a potential threat to the trainer who may feel that it reflects on his or her competence as a teacher. A potential solution to this problem is to separate the role of assessor from that of the trainer or mentor.

Formative assessment can be valuable but can prove threatening to a trainee if it is regarded as a series of mini-examinations to be negotiated during vocational training. Since its purpose is primarily educational, would it not be better to call it formative education rather than formative assessment? The same tool could be used for the purpose of summative assessment, provided the change in purpose was recognized.

General practitioners who are involved

in training at any level must accept responsibility for making assessment decisions. They should be aware that these decisions could profoundly affect the careers of those whom they assess and so must feel confident that the assessment tools they use are valid, reliable and in the public interest. However, even an imperfect assessment procedure can be used to introduce a sense of value. This must surely be better than an almost casual transition from traineeship to principalship?

In summary, summative assessment of competence for entry to general practice is necessary and is best conducted by a doctor who is not the trainee's mentor. Assessment of competence in order to identify learning needs should be formative. The assessment tools may be identical, but the different purposes must be clear to both the assessor and the person being assessed.

LORNA TAPPER-JONES
HELEN HOUSTON
NIGEL STOTT

Department of General Practice University of Wales College of Medicine Health Centre Maelfa, Llanedeyrn Cardiff CF3 7PN

## 24-hour cover

Sir.

As a former general practitioner, I am well acquainted with the burden which 24-hour cover places on doctors. However, I was surprised to read that relatively little progress has been made in providing alternative or supportive services (apart from the deputizing services) in the period since I left practice in 1984 (editorial, June Journal, p.226).

Most practices, I understand, are now group practices and operate from health centre-type premises. In addition, the support services provided therein have also been widened and increased. Practice nurses have, at last, made their presence felt and are now accepted as valuable members of the team. However, the practice nurse is only the first step on the way to a better and more efficient use of paramedical staff at the point of first contact with the general public. The suitably trained nurse practitioner and the general practitioner could work in tandem on a shift basis to provide 24-hour cover. This would ensure that, out of hours, all patients were treated by staff from the group practice.

It was stated in the editorial that 'whatever arrangements are made, it is important that primary medical care be provided by trained general practitioners at all times', but is this necessarily the case, and is it in fact necessary?<sup>2</sup>

In 1978, I asked 'is the general practitioner really necessary?'<sup>3</sup> and in a series of articles, I pointed out that suitably trained paramedical staff could provide a general practitioner type service, with the general practitioner acting in the role of specialist generalist.<sup>4</sup>

Reading the editorial by Maxwell and Toby, it does not appear as if there has been much movement in this direction. With the proper use of paramedical staff working with general practitioners, 24-hour cover could be provided, care remaining within the practice which would be to the mutual benefit of all concerned.

IAN F M SAINT-YVES

7 Mitchell Crescent Alloa Clackmannanshire FK10 1NN

#### References

- Saint-Yves IFM. The training of paramedics for primary health care. J R Soc Health 1983; 103: 135-139.
- Saint-Yves IFM. Need general practitioners be patients' first contact with health services? Lancet 1980: 2: 578-580
- 1980; 2: 578-580.
  3. Saint-Yves IFM. Is the GP really necessary? *BMJ* 1978; 1: 653-654.
- Saint-Yves IFM. At the crossroads of primary health care. J R Soc Health 1981; 101: 22-26.

## **Voluntary Service Overseas**

Sir,

Enclosed with the December 1992 copy of the *Journal* was a leaflet issued by Voluntary Service Overseas and the Royal College of General Practitioners encouraging doctors to enquire about medical posts abroad. I am a medical volunteer and have been working in Malawi for the last two years and I am concerned that some of the information in the leaflet is not strictly accurate.

Under VSO terms and conditions volunteer doctors are not paid a national wage in Malawi; they receive an allowance which is considerably less than that paid to a Malawian doctor in a similar position. It is supposed to cover basic living costs and is the same amount for every volunteer in Malawi, whatever their profession or level of responsibility. To maintain a reasonable standard of living the medical volunteer will have to be prepared to spend his or her own money.

Most VSO doctors are posted as district medical offices and spend much of their time with administration. At the end of two years they usually have reached some